

AGENDA ITEM NO. 9/2(d)

Parish:	Middleton	
Proposal:	i. VARIATION OF CONDITION 2 OF PLANNING CONSENT 23/01194/F : Proposed demolition of utility for new kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link, part conversion of outbuilding ii. (ii) VARIATION OF CONDITION 2 AND REMOVAL OF CONDITION 3,4,6,7 AND 8 OF PLANNING CONSENT 23/01195/LB : Application for listed building consent for proposed demolition of utility for new kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link, part conversion of outbuilding.	
Location:	Tower Farm Station Road Tower End Middleton	
Applicant:	Mr Thomas Barclay	
Case No:	i. 24/00838/F (Full Application) ii. 24/00811/LB (Listed Building Application)	
Case Officer:	i. Mrs C Dorgan ii. Mrs L Fawkes	i. & ii. Date for Determination: 27 June 2024 i. & ii. Extension of Time Expiry Date: 5 July 2024

Reason for Referral to Planning Committee – Application site is within the ownership of Cllr Barclay.

Neighbourhood Plan: No

Case Summary

The applications propose amendments to an extant planning consent for 'Proposed demolition of utility for new kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link, part conversion of outbuilding' at Tower Farm, Station Road, Tower End, Middleton (references - 23/01194/F & 23/01195/LB). The proposed amendments to the approved scheme include the repositioning of an existing window and the insertion of a new window at first floor on the north elevation. Also, previously where a gable end wall was to be demolished to facilitate an extension, the extension has been redesigned and only a doorway now needs to be inserted rather than the gable end removed.

Middleton is designated as a Rural Village under Policy CS02 of the Core Strategy 2011 and as such has a development boundary. The application site lies outside the development boundary on land classed as open countryside.

The report considers the issues relating to the applications for full planning permission and listed building consent.

Key Issues

Principle of Development
Design and Heritage
Any other material considerations.

Planning Committee
01 July 2024

Recommendation

- (i.) 24/00838/F – APPROVE**
- (ii.) 24/00811/LB - APPROVE**

THE APPLICATION

Tower Farmhouse, Tower End, Middleton was listed Grade II under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended for its special architectural or historic interest in 1988.

This report covers both full planning and listed building proposals.

The application proposes amendments to an extant planning consent for 'Proposed demolition of utility for new kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link, part conversion of outbuilding' at Tower Farm, Station Road, Tower End, Middleton (references - 23/01194/F & 23/01195/LB).

The extant consents permitted the demolition of a historic single storey extension and original gable end wall at ground floor level, and to build an extension on a larger footprint, to join the main farmhouse to an outbuilding.

The proposed amendments to the approved scheme include the repositioning of an existing window and the insertion of a new window at first floor on the north elevation. Also, previously where a gable end wall was to be demolished to facilitate an extension, the extension has been redesigned and only a doorway now needs to be inserted rather than the gable end wall removed.

The applications as submitted also include information submitted to address conditions 3, 4, 6, 7, and 8 of the approved LB consent. These conditions required; a sample panel, a schedule of materials to be salvaged for reuse in the development, a detailed scheme for demolition of the ground floor portion of the gable end of the house and the chimney stack, a comprehensive structural report and a photographic survey.

SUPPORTING CASE

Permission was granted under 23/01195/LB & 23/01194/F for the proposed demolition of the existing utility to make way for a new kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link and part conversion of outbuilding. The principle of this variation application (24/00838/F & 24/00811/LB) remains the same but the amount of historic fabric that will be lost is far less.

The approved scheme includes partial removal of the ground floor gable wall to provide an opening 4m wide. In this revised scheme this opening has been reduced to 1.58m wide. That represents a 60% reduction in historic fabric to be lost.

The other notable difference in this revised scheme compared to the original approved scheme is the ceiling in the outbuilding conversion was to be vaulted. In this revised scheme it will be a horizontal flat ceiling. Both methods retain the existing roof structure and the new joists that would provide support for the horizontal ceiling will slot in alongside the existing components without disruption.

Great care was taken to ensure the proposed new wall materials match the existing appropriately, the sample panel indicates this as part of Condition 3. Please see the sample panel photos submitted with the application.

Information for the removal of conditions 4,6,7 & 8 have been submitted in the application documents provided.

It is acknowledged that Tower Farmhouse is Grade II listed and that listed buildings need to be preserved for their historic value but it should be acknowledged that most of the features of this property have been lost over the years following renovation. This is not down to unauthorised works but necessary works to bring the building back to life and into use. It is in no doubt that without these modifications the building would be lost forever.

The exterior aesthetic of the building will remain unaltered and will be preserved. We recognise that the proposed work will still remove historical fabric in this revised scheme but the reduced amount will be welcomed and appreciated.

PLANNING HISTORY

23/01194/F & 23/01195/LB: Applications permitted: 12.12.2023 Committee decision: Kitchen/lobby extension and glazed link, part conversion of outbuilding - Tower Farm

17/00579/F & 17/00556/LB: Application Permitted: 22/05/17 Delegated decision - Installation of 2x external air source units - Tower Farm

17/01014/F & 17/01015/LB: Application Permitted: 19/07/17 Delegated decision - Formation of Drive access and wall feature to the front elevation to match the existing arrangements. Revised Design to application ref: 16/00906/F and 16/00907/LB - Middleton Towers

16/00906/F & 16/00907/LB: Application Permitted: 12/10/16 Delegated decision - New drive accesses to be formed and wall feature to the principle elevation to match the existing arrangements - Tower Farm House

15/00094/F & 15/00095/LB: Application Permitted: 20/03/15 Delegated decision - Porch extension to dwelling frontage and internal structural alterations - Tower Farm House

10/01829/F & 10/01831/LB: Application Permitted: 21/12/10 Delegated decision - Internal layout adjustments and associated works, new lead roof to North bay window, 2No new lead roof dormer windows to South, new link wall and new porch to South elevation - Tower Farm

08/00381/F & 08/00382/LB: Application Permitted: 15/04/08 Delegated decision - Conversion and repair of 3 buildings to residential dwellings - Tower Farm

RESPONSE TO CONSULTATIONS 24/00838/F & 24/00811/LB

Parish Council: NO COMMENTS RECEIVED

Local Highway Authority: NO OBJECTION

Having examined the submitted information, in terms of highway considerations for the adopted road network, we have no objection to the principle of the variation of condition 2.

**Planning Committee
01 July 2024**

24/00838/F & 24/00811/LB

Conservation Officer: NO OBJECTION

The scheme no longer proposes the demolition of the whole gable wall of the grade II listed building at ground floor level. It is now reduced to a single opening therefore the harm to the fabric of the listed building has been reduced. While there is proposed to be removal of historic walls and features in the outbuilding, the majority of these were permitted under the previous scheme which was allowed at planning committee.

Historic England: NO COMMENTS

Historic England are not offering advice on this application. We suggest that you seek the views of your specialist conservation and archaeological advisers. You may also find it helpful to refer to our published advice at <https://historicengland.org.uk/advice/find/>

REPRESENTATIONS:

NO COMMENTS RECEIVED

LDF CORE STRATEGY POLICIES

CS06 - Development in Rural Areas

CS08 - Sustainable Development

CS12 - Environmental Assets

SITE ALLOCATIONS AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT POLICIES PLAN 2016

DM5 – Enlargement or Replacement of Dwellings in the Countryside

DM15 – Environment, Design and Amenity

NATIONAL GUIDANCE

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)
Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)
National Design Guide 2021

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

The main considerations are:

Principle of development
Design and Heritage
Any other material considerations.

Principle of Development:

The application site is located within the village of Middleton, which is designated as a rural village within Policy CS02 of the Core Strategy 2011. The application site is not within the development boundary and would be assessed against Policy DM5 - Enlargement or

Planning Committee
01 July 2024

Replacement Dwellings in the Countryside and Policy DM 15 - Environment, Design and Amenity of the SADMPP 2016.

The proposal is for an extension to an existing dwelling within the curtilage; however due to the structure being a designated heritage asset, the conservation of the listed building would be considered within the policy test for extensions to existing dwellings. The extension has already been approved and so the principle of this has been accepted. The amendments proposed, the repositioning and insertion of a window and the amended opening in the external wall is not considered to result in harm to the heritage asset.

The proposals are therefore in accordance with Policy DM5 - Enlargement or Replacement Dwellings in the Countryside and Policy DM 15 - Environment, Design and Amenity of the SADMPP 2016.

Design and Heritage:

Tower Farm is a two storey, detached, Grade II listed building located within the village. The dwelling is constructed of galletted carstone with brick quoins and red clay pantiles. The outbuilding is of a similar construction but with a hipped pantile roof, and carstone walls without galletting. The listed building has undergone substantial alterations in recent years and it is important to retain as much of the original and historic fabric as possible.

The permitted extension required the demolition of the existing historic single storey side extension and the original gable end wall at ground floor level, to construct an extension of a larger footprint, joining the main farmhouse to the outbuilding. However, the amendment proposed does not require the demolition of such a large extent of this wall but that a doorway is instead cut into this.

The repositioning of a window and the insertion of a new window at first floor on the north elevation will enhance the balance of fenestration on this elevation. It is not considered that this would result in harm to the building subject to considerate construction methods and appropriate materials being used.

The variation also involves the demolition of a wall which was due to be retained in the previous plans and the retention of a wall which was due to be demolished. The spirit of this demolition in the outbuilding was approved in the previous scheme and although different walls are now proposed to be demolished and retained, this would not result in additional harm to the significance of the heritage asset.

Details have also been submitted with the listed building application to cover the previously applied conditions 4, 6, 7 and 8 on the Listed Building consent.

The information provided has included a detailed scheme of demolition, demolition plans, structural report, photographic survey and a schedule of materials . A sample panel will be constructed on site. This is considered to be enough information to support the ordinary discharge of these conditions.

The applicant has also constructed a sample panel to be considered as part of the planning application which was not submitted with the Listed Building consent. This sample panel is not acceptable at present. The bricks are not a good match by reason of the colour and the jointing in the carrstone is not acceptable and would jar with the existing building. The original condition 3 has therefore been re-applied to this Listed Building Consent variation application.

The NPPF emphasises the importance of good design and conservation of the historic environment.

Paragraph 195 states that Heritage assets are 'an irreplaceable resource, and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generations.'

Paragraph 205 states that 'When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation'.

Paragraph 206 states that 'Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.'

Paragraph 208 of the NPPF states that "Where a proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use". While it is considered that there is no public benefit to be gained from the proposal, development has been approved and the amendments proposed are not considered to cause additional harm to the heritage asset. In fact, the insertion of a doorway rather than the demolition of the gable wall represents an improvement to that previously permitted in terms of the protection of the heritage asset.

Policies CS06, CS08 and CS12 of the Core Strategy 2011 and DM5 of the SADMPP 2016 require proposals to maintain local character and a high-quality environment; protect and enhance the historic environment and respond to the context and character of places in West Norfolk by ensuring that the scale, density, layout, and access will enhance the quality of the environment. Policy DM15 of the SADMPP 2016 requires development proposals to be assessed against factors including heritage impact and visual impact.

The proposal, by virtue of its design, mass, and appearance would not result in further harm to the historic fabric, appearance, and historic plan of the listed building, over and above that which was approved previously. This scheme represents an improvement over what was approved previously and represents an enhancement to the proposals for the site. On this basis, the proposal is considered to comply with the provisions of the NPPF and policies CS06, CS08, CS12, DM5 and DM15 of the adopted local plan.

Any other material considerations:

Highways/ Access – The Local Highways Authority has no comments regarding the proposed amendments.

Historic England made no comments to the scheme but referred to the views of the Council's conservation officer.

CONCLUSION:

It is considered that the proposed amendments to the already permitted extension to a listed building, would not result in additional harm to the historic fabric, appearance, and historic plan of the building and therefore would not cause additional harm to the significance of the designated heritage asset. However, it is considered necessary, based on the current submission to reimpose the sample panel condition in the interests of the character and appearance of the Listed Building. The proposal is in accordance with the provisions of the

NPPF, and Policies CS06, CS08 and CS12 of the Core Strategy 2011, DM5 and DM15 of the SADMPP(2016).

RECOMMENDATION:

(i.) 24/00838/F - **APPROVE** subject to the imposition of the following condition(s):

- 1 Condition: The development hereby permitted shall be begun before 12 December 2026.
- 1 Reason: To comply with Section 92 of the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act, 2004.
- 2 Condition: The development hereby approved shall be implemented in accordance with the following approved plans:

669-10 Rev A Ground and Roof Plan
669-11 Rev A Sections and Elevations
669-12 Rev A Sections, Site and Location.
669-06: Crittal Window and Door Details
- 2 Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

(ii.) 24/00811/LB - **APPROVE** subject to the imposition of the following condition(s):

- 1 Condition: The development hereby permitted shall be begun before 12 December 2026.
- 1 Reason: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990, as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act, 2004.
- 2 Condition: This Listed Building Consent relates only to works specifically shown on the approved drawings listed below. Any other works, the need for which becomes apparent, are not covered by this consent and details must be submitted to the Council as Local Planning Authority and approved in writing, before work continues:

669-11 Rev A - Building Regulations Sections and Elevations
669-10 Rev A - Building Regulations Ground and Roof Plan
669-12 Rev A - Sections, Site and Location.
29507/101 A - Proposed Structural GA Plan
29507/102 A - Structural Sections 1-1 to 10-10
2907 - Demolition Statement - Submitted by PDC dated March 2024
2907 - Structural Report - Submitted by PDC dated March 2024
2907 - Method Statement - Submitted by PDC dated March 2024
Photographic Survey - Submitted 2-5-2024
Schedule of Materials - Submitted 2-5-2024
669-06 - Crittall window and door details dated March 2023
- 2 Reason: To ensure a satisfactory standard of works in the interests of safeguarding the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.

Planning Committee
01 July 2024

- 3 Condition: The brick/stone to be used for the external surfaces of the building hereby approved shall be constructed in accordance with a sample panel, prepared on site for the inspection and written approval of the Local Planning Authority. The sample panel shall measure at least 1 metre x 1 metre using the proposed materials, mortar type, bond, and pointing technique to be used in the approved scheme.
- 3 Reason: To ensure that the materials are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 4 Condition: All mortar, plaster and render to be used in the works hereby approved shall be lime rich and cement free to a specification to be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development.
- 4 Reason: To ensure that such details are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.